ISU**ADVANCE**

Collaborative Transformation
Synthesis Report Workshop
April 1, 2008

ISU**ADVANCE**

Supported by the National Science Foundation

IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY
OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

Collaborative Transformation Synthesis Report Workshop

Welcome and Introduction

Susan Carlson,

PI of ISU ADVANCE Program

Associate Provost for

Faculty Advancement & Diversity

ISU ADVANCE

Sharon R. Bird, PhD
ADVANCE Grant Co-PI and Research Director

Lisa Larson, ADVANCE Equity Advisor, LAS

Kristen Constant, ADVANCE Professor, Materials Science and Engineering

ISU ADVANCE
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

ISU ADVANCE Program Strategy

- Enhancing recruitment and retention of women & minorities by focusing on:
  - Creating <u>workplace cultures, practices and structures</u> *that are more conducive to* recruitment, retention and promotion of all faculty, paying particular attention to the issues that confront underrepresented groups.

*ISU***ADVANCE**

ISU Comprehensive Approach

- "Top-down" policies are necessary, but insufficient for creating changes in organizational work environments (Bailyn & Fletcher 2008; Blair-Loy and Wharton 2004; Valian 1999).

- "Bottom-up," process-oriented efforts are necessary to bring about changes in departmental cultures and practices (Ely and Meyerson 2004).

ISU**ADVANCE**

ISU ADVANCE Collaborative Transformation

- "Bottom-up," process-oriented action research model developed by organizational scholars. Methodology:
  - stresses collaboration between researchers and departmental faculty.
  - involves "mirroring back" to faculty in each department aspects of their own workplace climate.

ISU**ADVANCE**

Partnering with Departments

- Action research involves social science researchers working with Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) departments to:

  - assess existing work climate and faculty recruitment, retention and promotion efforts.
  - develop strategies for enhancing climate, recruitment, retention and promotion.

*ISU*ADVANCE

Why Action Research?

- Assumes that faculty are most apt to work on the issues that they have identified as most important in their own work environment.

- Encourages faculty to play an active role in the process of improving working conditions for everyone.

ISU**ADVANCE**

How Many Departments?

- 9 departments over 5 years:
  - Year 1: bring in 3 departments.
  - Year 3: bring in 3 more departments.
  - Year 5: bring in final 3 departments.

ISU*ADVANCE*

Long Term Benefits

- By end of project (2011) ISU ADVANCE will:
    - Produce <u>assessment tools</u> for recognizing potential obstacles to productive work climate and recruitment, retention and promotion efforts.
    - Produce <u>strategy tools</u> for enhancing work climate and recruitment, retention and promotion of faculty—based on documentation of which strategies work best and under what conditions.

*ISU***ADVANCE**

Assessment and Strategy Tools

- Designed to help faculty, especially those in leadership roles, identify and address potential barriers to faculty scholarly success, including those that hinder the recruitment, retention and promotion of women faculty.

*ISU***ADVANCE**

Collaborative Transformation Synthesis Report

- Presents initial findings from years 1 and 2 of project:

  - Data collection for first 3 focal departments.
  - Data analysis and report for first 3 departments.
  - Initial departmental change strategy efforts.

- Over the next 3 years we will build on our initial findings.

ISU**ADVANCE**

Focal Department Data

- Focus groups and interviews with faculty in 3 STEM departments.

- Average faculty participation rate for the first three focal departments was **71.5 percent**.

- Focus group and interview transcriptions yielded more than 1000 double-spaced pages of raw data.

- Departmental governance documents departmental web sites provided additional information about department structures/policies.

ISU**ADVANCE**

Data Serve Multiple Purposes

- Departmental data were used to "mirror back" to each department those aspects of work climate that enhance or detract from faculty members' work.

  – Report produced for each separate department.

- Data were then analyzed collectively to determine which issues the departments all shared in common.

  – Synthesis report produced for broader ISU community.

ISU ADVANCE

Building Assessment and Change Strategy Tool Kit

- Data collected from additional departments will be used to:

    - further develop strategies for enhancing workplace climate and enhance recruitment, retention and promotion of women faculty and underrepresented faculty of color.

*ISU*ADVANCE

Synthesis Report: Six Main Themes

Lisa Larson, PhD
ADVANCE Equity Advisor, LAS
With Assistance from LeAnn Mills and Verena Bonitz

ISUADVANCE

Six Main Themes

1. Spatial proximity and facility issues
2. Gaps between stated ideals and reality
3. Mentoring of Assistant and Associate professors
4. Democratic participation
5. Recruitment and retention
6. Family friendly policies

ISU**ADVANCE**

1. Spatial Proximity and Facility Issues

- A predominance of faculty identified space and location as an issue
- Interaction → collaboration, mentoring, sharing information
- Variation in lab and office spaces impacts:
  - productivity and success of current faculty
  - ability to recruit and retain faculty.
- A minority of faculty disagreed

*ISU***ADVANCE**
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

2. Gaps Between Department Ideals and Actual Practices

A. Inequities in service and teaching work load

- Source of work load inequity
  - Lack of clarity about how decisions are made
  - Lack of information

B. Salary inequities don't consistently match with level of productivity

- Sources of salary inequities
  - Lack of clarity
  - Departmental mergers
  - External offers
  - Salary increases based on percentages

ISU ADVANCE
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

2. Gaps Between Stated Ideals and Actual Practices cont.

- Those most likely to express dissatisfaction were faculty discovering inequity after the fact
- Those least likely to express dissatisfaction are those who:
  - were unaware
  - believed the inequities were justified
  - believed inequities were too hard to change
  - were satisfied with the gap
- Minority of Faculty said that teaching wasn't rewarded as ISU policy ideals imply it should be.

ISUADVANCE
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

3. Mentoring of Assistant and Associate Professors

- Most faculty saw mentoring junior faculty as part of their role
- Not same with associate professors
- Chairs meeting with untenured faculty helpful
- Process different for Assistant and Associate profs
- Formal mechanisms for feedback about tenure that are in place reduce anxiety and ambiguity

ISUADVANCE
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

3. Mentoring of Assistant and Associate Professors, cont.

- Proximity influences frequency of informal mentoring

- Associates carry disproportionate service work load

- Mentoring increases knowledge of expectations

- Quality of mentoring varies, no formal evaluation of mentoring quality

ISU ADVANCE
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

4. Democratic Participation: Ideal vs. Reality

- Ideal: All tenured and tenure-track faculty share ideas freely

- Assistant professors were less likely to express that this ideal was reality.

- This pattern continues when faculty need to request resources or advice from a Chair.

- Reasons:
  - didn't want to appear critical
  - didn't want to appear less competent
  - wanted to look like a 'team player.'

ISU ADVANCE
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

5. Recruitment: Developing Candidate Pools

- Support for increasing diversity
- Concerns:
  - Small pool of diverse applicants
  - Less qualified candidates
- Potential solution: larger applicant pools

ISU **ADVANCE**
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

5. Recruitment: Evaluating Applicants

- Involvement of faculty varies

- Concerns about current practices:
  - After interview, vague or ill-defined reasons for eliminating a candidate.
  - Before interview, vague or biased criteria for determining "excellence".
  - Ranking candidates after faculty vote

ISU **ADVANCE**
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

5. Recruitment: Presenting a Positive Work Environment

- Issues often considered by applicants:
  - Department atmosphere
  - Commitment to mentoring
  - Issues of diversity
  - Child and elder care
  - Partner's career

- Faculty noted the need to be viewed as a "family friendly" department and University.

ISU **ADVANCE**
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

5. Retention

- Good recruitment → retention
- Fair tenure decisions regarding family-friendly policies
- Work/life balance
- Some factors determined at University, not department, level

ISUADVANCE
IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY

6. Family Friendly Policies

- Noted increase in University-wide policies that support family, but stigma may exist for using these policies
- On-site childcare is often not a viable option
- Concerns exist about stop the tenure clock policies for STEM faculty

Developing Departmental Change Strategies

Kristen Constant, ADVANCE
Professor, Materials Science and Engineering

ISU **ADVANCE**

Developing Departmental Change Strategies

- We've discussed how you generate <u>REAL change</u> through collaborative transformation

- How do you know WHAT to change?
  - Assessment tools

- What does this look like from the ground level?
  - Change processes – from the department perspective

Assessment Tools

- Remember the purpose:

Reshape structures, practices and culture to optimize productivity and satisfaction of ALL faculty

Improve recruitment, retention and promotion

ISU**ADVANCE**

Assessment Tools

- Consider the constraints
  - University wide policies, physical structures, etc.

- Focus on what CAN be controlled at the departmental level

- What are these factors for a given department?

- What strategies will work for a given department?

ISU**ADVANCE**

Change Strategies

- Derived from:
  - Focus group suggest
  - Ongoing depar   t discussions
  - ADVAN   searchers knowledge of
    suc   ul practices in professional
           rkplaces

Disclaimer: Not all strategies will be effective for all departments

ISUADVANCE

1. Spatial proximity

- <u>General approach:</u> Leaders should CREATE spaces and time periods that promote interaction

- Specific strategies:
  - Informal meetings with Chairs/Asst. Profs.
  - More regular faculty meetings
  - Retreats that focus on collaborative opportunities

*ISU*ADVANCE

2. Gaps between stated ideals and real practices

- Specific Strategies
  - Recognize (award) meaningful contributions for leadership/teaching excellence
  - Share information about averages and ranges of work distribution
  - Effective Mentoring

ISU**ADVANCE**

3. Mentoring

- <u>General Approach</u> – develop, implement & support comprehensive mentoring structure

- Specific strategies

  - Expectations of junior faculty communicated clearly at meetings held for that purpose

  - Communicate aggregated data on the productivity of successful faculty

  - Bridge spatial gaps by structuring interaction opportunities (Issue 1)

3. Mentoring

- More strategies
  - Discuss mentoring needs of associate professors (new program?)
  - Engage in departmental conversation about tenure and promotion criteria and non-traditional scholarship

*ISU*ADVANCE

4. Democratic Participation

- Specific strategies
  - Faculty skills development opportunities (for effective meetings)
  - Faculty meeting conversations
  - POST written reminders of best practices in conference rooms
  - Consider a process monitor
    - to facilitate participation by all

ISU**ADVANCE**

5. Recruitment: Diversity/Excellence

- Efforts to diversify is sometimes seen as a threat to maintaining excellence

- General approach: Validate the link between diversity and excellence

- Specific Strategies
  - Use explicitly agreed upon evaluation criteria
  - Monitor discussions to ensure all evaluations are supported by evidence

-

ISU**ADVANCE**

5. Recruitment: Candidate Pools

- General approaches: Expand pool
- Specific Strategies
  - Expand pool-
    - Advance identification of potential candidates
      - Ongoing effort, prior to a specific search
      - Invite seminar speakers
    - Targeted ads and recruiting efforts

*ISU*ADVANCE

5. Recruitment: Unintentional Bias

- Specific Strategies
  - Uniform evaluation forms
  - Thoroughly discuss criteria BEFORE review of any candidates
  - Discuss and document strengths and weaknesses of all candidates.

*ISU*ADVANCE

6. Awareness of Family Friendly Policies

- Specific Strategies
  - Chairs and mentors advise junior faculty about these policies
  - Consider a departmental-specific policy about release time and or teaching coverage
  - Chair should express support for people who use the policies and educate faculty how to evaluate those who do.

ISU**ADVANCE**

The departmental perspective

- All these issues were shown as common to all departments, but each has a different existing culture
  - Discuss/prioritize all issues with faculty
  - Develop tailored action plans
  - Facilitate/promote opportunities to learn and grow
- There are SOME issues that can't be handled at the department level

ISU ADVANCE

Routinizing New Practices

- Because the colleges and departments have different norms and cultures:

  - On-going discussions about work environment, recruitment, retention and promotion processes are necessary.

  - Sharing strategies across departments is also helpful.

Routinizing New Practices (cont.)

- Because the colleges and departments have different norms and cultures:

    - Valuing input from all departmental faculty about work climate is necessary.
    - Tailoring action plans to each department is required.
    - Facilitating/promoting opportunities to learn and grow is necessary.

Where we go from here…

- As a department –
  - continue to develop (and implement) strategies for change

- As a program –
  - Continue to develop infrastructure for assessing (and addressing) the needs of all faculty

Thank you.

Questions?

ISU**ADVANCE**

Six Main Themes

1. Spatial proximity and facility issues
2. Gaps between stated ideals and reality
3. Mentoring of Assistant and Associate professors
4. Democratic participation
5. Recruitment and retention
6. Family friendly policies

ISU**ADVANCE**

*ISU*ADVANCE

Collaborative Transformation
Synthesis Report Workshop
April 1, 2008

IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY
OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY